

Understanding All Minus One Through Illustrations

Illustrations of Mill's quotes are depicted throughout *All Minus One*. The images illustrate the Mill's key messages and help the reader better understand and interpret the arguments presented in *All Minus One*. Below is a list of discussion questions and activities to encourage students to interpret the illustrations that accompany the texts and to create their own illustrations to accompany the text. Besides understanding the important words of *All Minus One*, discussion of the illustrations will help students to better grasp Mill's arguments. **Please note that this activity refers to the illustrations in the first edition of** *All Minus One***.**

Illustration Discussions

- 1. The first illustration is of a woman with the word "shame" sewn into her finger. The thread from her finger connects to a miniature man and woman who she is holding and whose mouths have been sewn shut by the same thread.
 - a. What message does this illustration convey?
- **2. On pages 11-12,** there is a human connected to a chain accompanied by the excerpt: "History teems with instances of truth put down by persecution. If not suppressed forever, it may be thrown back for centuries."
 - a. How does the illustration depict the excerpt? Do you agree? How would you depict the excerpt?
- **3. On pages 13-14,** a row of masked humans lines the bottom of the pages. The excerpt that accompanies the illustration states: "Our merely social intolerance kills no one, roots out no opinions, but induces men to disguise them, or to abstain from any active effort for their diffusion."
 - a. What is the significance of the mask? Why is one human pulling away their mask? What does this signify? What is the difference between that person and the other masked humans who have on the masks and their arms by their sides?
 - b. [The following quote also describes the illustration: "Those in whose eyes this reticence on the part of heretics is no evil, should consider in the first place, that in consequence of it there is never any fair and thorough discussion of heretical opinions; and that such of them as could not stand such a discussion, though they may be prevented from spreading, do not disappear."]
- **4. On pages 15-16,** an illustration of a human screaming inside the mind of another human is depicted to illustrate the following text: "But it is not the minds of heretics that are deteriorated most, by the ban placed on all inquiry which does not end in the orthodox conclusions. The greatest harm done is to those who are not heretics, and whose whole mental development is cramped, and their reason cowed [frightened into submission or compliance], by the fear of heresy."
 - a. Dissect the illustration. Why is one human screaming inside the head of another? Based on the excerpt, what do their facial expressions tell you? What's on the outside of the man's head? Based on the excerpt, what do these symbols represent? Along the jawline of the man are the words "after quitely." What is meant by this phrase?

Understanding All Minus One Through Illustrations

- **5.** In the illustration on pages 17-18, all but one human is walking away from a lit doorway. The illustration corresponds with the quote: "We can expect no fresh start... until we again assert our mental freedom."
 - a. How would you caption this illustration, or what excerpt would you emphasize to match this illustration?
- **6.** What is the illustration on page 22 depicting? Does the following quote align well with this illustration? "Beliefs not grounded on conviction are apt to give way before the slightest semblance of an argument." Why? In what other way could the quote be depicted?
- **7. The illustration on page 24** depicts a man in the background with a woman inside of a diamond in the foreground to accompany the text: "He must feel the whole force of the difficulty which the true view of the subject has to encounter and dispose of; else he will never really possess himself of the portion of truth which meets and removes that difficulty."
 - a. What emotions are each expressing? How do these emotions relate to the quote? What does the diamond and the vibrations from the diamond represent?
 - b. The quote is one illustration of argument number two: "He who knows only his side of the case, knows little of that." After reading the quote in the context of the paragraph (the text is on page 23), would you have chosen a different part of the paragraph to illustrate? Why?
- **8.** The illustration on page 26 depicts a living truth and a dead dogma. What does it mean for a truth to be living? What is a dead dogma? What message is the illustrator trying to convey?
 - a. The quote to accompany this illustration is "Instead of a vivid conception and a living belief, there remain only a few phrases retained by rote; or, if any part, the shell and husk only of the meaning is retained, the finer essence being lost." Do the quote and illustration complement each other well? Are there words in the quote you think should have been part of the illustration?
- **9. On page 30,** three people are depicted—two have their eyes closed and one has her eyes open. Two quotes accompany this illustration: "Both teachers and learners go to sleep at their post, as soon as there is no enemy in the field," and "A contemporary author has well spoken of 'the deep slumber of a decided opinion.""
 - a. What are the similarities and differences in the meaning of each quote? Does the illustration encapsulate well the meaning behind both quotes? Should the illustrator have created a separate illustration for each quote?
- **10. The illustration on page 34** accompanies the quote: "Every opinion which embodies somewhat of the portion of truth which the common opinion omits, ought to be considered precious, with whatever amount of error and confusion that truth may be blended."
 - a. What is the illustration depicting? Is there another way the quote could be depicted?

Understanding All Minus One Through Illustrations

- **11.** Look at the illustration on page 36. Did the illustrator successfully depict the quote: "Truth, in the great practical concerns of life, is so much a question of the reconciling and combining of opposites"? Why? Do you think the colors used to create the illustration hold some significance?
- **12. The opposing illustrations on pages 37 and 38** aimed to illustrate the quote: "Not the violent conflict between parts of the truth, but the quiet suppression of half of it, is the formidable evil; there is always hope when people are forced to listen to both sides."
 - a. Which part of the quote is depicted? Which part or parts did the illustrator omit? What message is the illustrator trying to convey through his inclusion of some elements of the quote but the omission of others?
- **13. On page 40,** the illustrator depicts the "one," the one person who holds a view contrary to the rest of humanity. The illustration is beneath the quote: "This is the real morality of public discussion: and if often violated, I am happy to think that there are many controversialists who to a great extent observe it, and a still greater number who conscientiously strive towards it."
 - a. What is the "it" to which the author refers? Why does the illustrator depict the lone person to illustrate "it"?
- **14.** The cover of *All Minus One* is of the lone eccentric with her eyes open and the rest of humanity with their eyes closed. In the final illustration of *All Minus One* the eyes of all of humanity are open.
 - a. What is the significance of these contrasting illustrations? How did the eyes of humanity come to be open?
- **15.** Now that you have examined each illustration, look through them again from start to finish. You may notice that the colors used by the illustrator change from start to finish. How so? Do you think the illustrator did this on purpose? If yes, what message do you think he intended to convey?

Activity Extension

Have students illustrate the three central arguments themselves. Tell students to show they understand Mill's three arguments by creating their own illustration for each, which are described in response to the question: "What harm could be done by silencing this lone eccentric?"

First, choose one passage from each of the three sections you consider the best articulation of each argument, then illustrate those three passages. In other words, find the best passage from the section that describes the argument "the opinion may possibly be true," then illustrate that passage. Do the same for the other two arguments.

- 1. The opinion may possibly be true.
- 2. He who knows only his side of the case, knows very little of that.
- 3. Conflicting doctrines share the truth between them.

Teachers can assign this as an in-class activity or for homework.